

**AL ESCANDDRONA SCHOOL
UNDER THE COMMANDER'S EMERGENCY RESPONSE PROGRAM
BAGHDAD, IRAQ**

SUSTAINMENT ASSESSMENT

**SIGIR PA-07-110
JANUARY 14, 2008**

| Report Documentation Page | | | | Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188 | |
|--|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---|---------------------------------|
| Public reporting burden for the collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to a penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number. | | | | | |
| 1. REPORT DATE 14 JAN 2008 | | 2. REPORT TYPE | | 3. DATES COVERED 00-00-2008 to 00-00-2008 | |
| 4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE Al Escanddrona School Under the Commander's Emergency Response Program Baghdad, Iraq. Sustainment Assessment | | | | 5a. CONTRACT NUMBER | |
| | | | | 5b. GRANT NUMBER | |
| | | | | 5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER | |
| 6. AUTHOR(S) | | | | 5d. PROJECT NUMBER | |
| | | | | 5e. TASK NUMBER | |
| | | | | 5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER | |
| 7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) Office of the Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction, 400 Army Navy Drive, Arlington, VA, 22202 | | | | 8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER | |
| 9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) | | | | 10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) | |
| | | | | 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S) | |
| 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution unlimited | | | | | |
| 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES | | | | | |
| 14. ABSTRACT | | | | | |
| 15. SUBJECT TERMS | | | | | |
| 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: | | | 17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT Same as Report (SAR) | 18. NUMBER OF PAGES 22 | 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON |
| a. REPORT unclassified | b. ABSTRACT unclassified | c. THIS PAGE unclassified | | | |



SPECIAL INSPECTOR GENERAL FOR IRAQ RECONSTRUCTION

January 14, 2008

MEMORANDUM FOR COMMANDING GENERAL, MULTI-NATIONAL FORCES-
IRAQ,
COMMANDER, JOINT CONTRACTING COMMAND-
IRAQ/AFGHANISTAN
COMMANDER, GULF REGION DIVISION, U.S. ARMY
CORPS OF ENGINEERS
DIRECTOR, IRAQ TRANSITION ASSISTANCE OFFICE

SUBJECT: Report on the Rehabilitation of the Al Escanddrona School in the Karadah district of the city of Baghdad, Iraq (Report Number SIGIR PA-07-110)

The Office of the Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction is assessing projects funded under the Commander's Emergency Response Program to provide real-time relief and reconstruction information to interested parties to enable appropriate action, when warranted.

We are providing this report for your information and use. It addresses the current status of the Al Escanddrona School in the Karadah district of the city of Baghdad, Iraq. The assessment was made to determine whether the project was operating at the capacity stated in the original contract.

This report does not contain any negative findings or recommendations for corrective action. As a result, management comments are not required.

We appreciate the courtesies extended to our staff. If you have any questions please contact Mr. Brian Flynn at brian.flynn@iraq.centcom.mil or at DSN 318-343-9244. For public or congressional queries concerning this report, please contact SIGIR Congressional and Public Affairs at publicaffairs@sigir.mil or at (703) 428-1100.

Stuart W. Bowen, Jr.
Inspector General

Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction

SIGIR PA-07-110

January 14, 2008

Al Escanddrona School Under the Commander's Emergency Response Program Baghdad, Iraq

Synopsis

Introduction. The Office of the Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction is assessing projects funded under the Commander's Emergency Response Program to provide real-time relief and reconstruction information to interested parties to enable appropriate action, when warranted.

Project Assessment Objectives. The objective of this project assessment was to determine whether the project was operating at the capacity stated in the original contract. To accomplish the objective, we determined whether the project was at full capability or capacity when accepted by the government, when transferred to Iraqi operators, and during the United States Army Corps of Engineers inspection on 5 November 2007. We conducted this limited scope assessment in accordance with the Quality Standards for Inspections issued by the President's Council on Integrity and Efficiency. The assessment team included an engineer/inspector and an auditor/inspector

The overall objective of the project was to rehabilitate the Al Escanddrona School in the Karadah district of the city of Baghdad to benefit approximately 450 children. On March 12, 2006, a firm-fixed-price contract for \$86,615 was awarded to a local contractor. The Al Escanddrona School rehabilitation project was completed in May 2006, and the final payment to the contractor was paid in June 2006

Conclusions. Our inspection of the Al Escanddrona School included a review and analysis of contract documentation, including the contract itself, related contract documentation, the Statement of Work, the design package (drawings and specifications), quality control reports, quality assurance reports, construction progress photos, final situation reports, invoices, submittals, closeout documents, photographs provided by the United States Army Corps of Engineers from a visit on 5 November 2007, and aerial imagery.

Because of increased insurgent activity in the Karadah district of Baghdad, both the United States Army and the private security contractor denied the assessment team's repeated requests for escorts to the school. Consequently, the assessment team was unable to perform a site assessment. However, the United States Army Corps of Engineers documentation confirmed that contract provisions were met and that the school was operational. In addition, United States Army Corps of Engineers provided photos from a visit on 5 November 2007, which reconfirmed the documentation and also provided photographs of the school's current condition.

Recommendations. This report does not contain any negative findings or recommendations for corrective action; therefore, management comments were not required. However, the United States Army Corps of Engineers, Gulf Region Division provided clarifying information for the photos it provided for the report and corrected the

type of contract cited. The clarifying and corrective information provided by the United States Army Corps of Engineers, Gulf Region Division has been incorporated into this final report.

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| Synopsis | i |
| Introduction | |
| Objective of the Project Assessment | 1 |
| Pre-Site Assessment Background | 1 |
| Contract, Costs and Payments | 1 |
| Statement of Work | 1 |
| Project Objective, Pre-Construction Description | 2 |
| Project Design | 4 |
| Site Progress During Construction | 4 |
| Site Assessment | 8 |
| Conclusions | 12 |
| Recommendations and Management Comments | 12 |
| Appendices | |
| A. Scope and Methodology | 13 |
| B. Acronyms | 14 |
| C. Report Distribution | 15 |
| D. Project Assessment Team Members | 17 |

Introduction

Objective of the Project Assessment

The Office of the Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction is assessing projects funded under the Commander's Emergency Response Program to provide real-time relief and reconstruction information to interested parties to enable appropriate action, when warranted. The objective of this project assessment was to determine whether the project was operating at the capacity stated in the original contract. To accomplish the objective, we determined if the project was at full capability or capacity when accepted by the government, when transferred to Iraqi operators, and during a United States Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) site visit on 5 November 2007 as documented in site photographs and reports.

Pre-Site Assessment Background

Contract, Costs and Payments

Contract W917BG-06-C-0075 was awarded on 12 March 2006 to a local contractor. The contract was a firm-fixed-price contract for the net amount of \$86,615. The contract, W917BG-06-C-0075, contained two modifications.

Modification P00001 deleted and included additional line items in the Bill of Quantities for the Al Escanddrone School. The deleted and added line items resulted in no additional charge to the government.

Modification P00002, dated 31 March 2006, revised the Bill of Quantities based on discussions held during the preconstruction meeting. The changes resulted in no additional cost to the government.

Based on information provided by the USACE, the contractor received the Notice to Proceed on 13 March 2006, the headmaster signed an Acceptance of Finished Works on 16 May 2006, and the contractor was paid in full on 28 June 2006 for the Al Escanddrone School. By reference, the Federal Acquisition Regulation 52.246-21, Warranty of Construction clause, was incorporated into the contract and the standard one-year from date of acceptance by the government construction warranty was applicable. However, the Al Escanddrone School warranty had expired when the USACE visited the school on 5 November 2007.

Statement of Work

The Statement of Work (SOW) was for the renovation, repair, and upgrade of existing architectural features, plumbing, and mechanical and electrical systems for the Al Escanddrone School. The SOW included the following:

- general maintenance for the building roof, walls, windows, doors, and painting on the exterior and interior
- rehabilitation of the three lavatories, and reconnection to the water supply and sewage
- supply and installation of a new 50 liter per minute pump with 12 meters (m) of head, two hot water heaters, and one meter cubed water plastic tank

- replacement of all electrical building network wiring
- provision and installation of a 2.5 m tall security fence
- design and construction of a new guard house (9 m by 3.5 m by 2 m tall)

The contract's SOW included specific requirements and stated that materials and equipment will be replaced with equipment that meets the original design intent of the facility.

Project Objective, Pre-Construction Description

The description of the facility (pre-construction) was based on information obtained from the contract and the USACE project file. The overall objective of the project was to rehabilitate the Al Escanddrona School, located in the Karadah district of Baghdad, to benefit approximately 450 children.

Before the rehabilitation project, the Al Escanddrona School was in major disrepair due to years of neglect. The school had cracks in the school room (Site Photo 1), loose electrical wiring (Site Photos 2 and 3), broken windows that posed safety hazards for the children (Site Photo 4), and an unusable lavatory.



Site Photo 1. Open expansion joint before renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)



Site Photo 2. Loose electrical wiring before renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)



Site Photo 3. Broken light fixture with unsafe wiring before renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)



Site Photo 4. Safety hazard – broken windows at the school before renovation
(Photo courtesy of USACE)

Project Design

The contract's SOW included specific requirements and stated that materials and equipment would be replaced with equipment that meets the original design intent of the facility.

The contractor was to design and build a new guard house for the Al Escanddrona School. The USACE Gulf Region Central (GRC) was unable to locate the design drawings for the new guard house. Therefore, the adequacy of the design drawings could not be determined.

Site Progress During Construction

Throughout the Al Escanddrona School rehabilitation project, progress photographs taken by the USACE documented on-going construction activities. We reviewed and subsequently relied on selected photographs to document examples of construction practices and techniques employed by the contractor prior to the project being accepted in May 2006.

Quality Management

Department of the Army Engineering Regulation (ER) 1180-1-6, dated 30 September 1995, provides general policy and guidance for establishing quality management procedures in the execution of construction contracts. According to

ER 1180-1-6, "...obtaining quality construction is a combined responsibility of the construction contractor and the government."

We reviewed the contract files to determine the adequacy of the quality control (QC) reports. According to USACE representatives, no QC reports were completed for the March 2006 contract. In addition, the contractor did not provide any test results for any of the work done for this project.

USACE ER 1110-1-12 and the Project and Contracting Office (PCO) Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) Construction Number (CN)-100 specified requirements for a government quality assurance (QA) program. Specifically, PCO SOP CN-100 provides guidance for the USACE Gulf Region Division (GRD) staffs to "...ascertain if the contractor QC system is functioning and the specified level of construction quality is being attained."

The contractor received the Notice to Proceed on 13 March 2006, and the headmaster signed an Acceptance of Finished Works on 16 May 2006 for the Al Escanddrone School project. There were nine daily QA reports for the duration of the project. The limited QA reports and photographs recorded the various stages of construction activities that occurred at the Al Escanddrone school project and documented the final project inspection.

The contract called for general maintenance to be performed by the contractor on the building roof, walls, windows, doors, and exterior and interior painting. Site Photo 5 shows the school's exterior painting by the contractor.



Site Photo 5. Exterior painting after renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)

The contractor rehabilitated the lavatories, as required by the contract. Site Photo 6 shows the contractor's performance in tiling the lavatory and installing the sinks. The contractor installed new eastern-style toilets as well.



Site Photo 6. Sinks after renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)

According to the contract, the contractor was to replace all electrical building network wiring. Site Photo 7 shows the electrical rewiring, the new electrical switch plates are shown in Site Photo 8, and the contractor-installed new air conditioning unit is shown in Site Photo 9.



Site Photo 7. Interior painting and electrical rewiring after renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)



Site Photo 8. Correctly installed electrical switches and ceiling fan control after renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)



Site Photo 9. Proper air conditioning installation after renovation (Photo courtesy of USACE)

The contract stated that the contractor was to provide and install a security fence, and Site Photo 10 shows the fence/wall provided by the contractor as well as the painting for the fence/wall.



Site Photo 10. New masonry compound fence/wall (Photo courtesy of USACE)

Warranties

The contract stated that the window air conditioning unit had a two-year warranty, but did not specify any other warranties. So, for the new equipment purchased and installed for the contract, the contract file lacked any Operations and Maintenance documentation, manuals, and/or warranty information.

Site Assessment

Our review of the Al Escanddrona School included a review and analysis of contract documentation, including the contract itself, related contract documentation, SOW, design package (drawings and specifications), QC reports, QA reports, construction progress photos, final situation reports, invoices, submittals, closeout documents, photographs provided by the USACE visit on 5 November 2007, and aerial imagery.

Due to increased activity in the Karadah district of Baghdad, both private security contractors and the U.S. Army denied the assessment team's requests for escorts to the school. Consequently, the assessment team was unable to perform a site assessment. However, the USACE visited the site on 5 November 2007 and the photos taken were used to confirm documentation that the contract provisions were met and that the school was operational.



Aerial Image 1. Imagery overview of the Al Escanddrona School taken on 16 September 2007.

General Observations

All work completed appeared to meet the SOW requirements. The Al Escanddrona School was rehabilitated and was benefiting the children as intended.

USACE visited the school on 5 November 2007, 18 months after the headmaster signed an Acceptance of Finished Works in May 2006. Based upon the USACE's photographs taken on the site visit, the following SOW requirements appeared completed:

- general maintenance for the building roof, (Site Photo 11) walls, windows, doors, and painting on the exterior and interior (Site Photo 12)
- rehabilitated lavatory
- supply and installation of a new water plastic tank (Site Photo 11)
- replacement of all electrical building network wiring
- provision and installation of a 2.5 meter tall security fence (Site Photo 13)



Site Photo 11. Roof maintenance after occupancy and use (Photo courtesy of USACE)



Site Photo 12. Interior painting after occupancy and use (Photo courtesy of USACE)



**Site Photo 13. School yard within compound wall after occupancy and use
(Photo courtesy of USACE)**

General school maintenance and upkeep was not continued after the turnover as shown in the USACE photograph (Site Photo 14) of a hanging thermostat. This was also evidenced by USACE photographs (not pictured) of a broken door handle and a hole in the wall which were provided to our assessment team. During the review of the USACE photographs, we did not detect any instances of incomplete construction.



**Site Photo 14. Tampered with wiring and added ceiling fan control after occupancy and use
(Photo courtesy of USACE)**

Conclusions

Our review of the Al Escanddrona School included a review and analysis of contract documentation, including the contract itself, related contract documentation, the Statement of Work, the design package (drawings and specifications), quality control reports, quality assurance reports, construction progress photos, final situation reports, invoices, submittals, closeout documents, photographs provided by USACE from a visit on 5 November 2007, and aerial imagery.

Due to increased insurgent activity in the Karadah district of Baghdad, both private security contractors and the U.S. Army denied the assessment team's requests for escorts to the school. Consequently, the assessment team was unable to perform a site assessment. However, USACE documentation confirmed that contract provisions were met and that the school was operational. In addition USACE provided photos from a visit on 5 November 2007 that reconfirmed the documentation and provided photos of the school's current condition.

Recommendations and Management Comments

This report does not contain any negative findings or recommendations for corrective action. Therefore, management comments are not required.

Appendix A. Scope and Methodology

We performed this project assessment from September through December 2007 in accordance with the Quality Standards for Inspections issued by the President's Council on Integrity and Efficiency. The assessment team included an engineer/inspector and an auditor/inspector.

Due to increased insurgent activity in the Karadah district of Baghdad, both private security contractors and the U.S. Army denied the assessment team's requests for escorts to the school. Consequently, the assessment team was unable to perform a site assessment.

In performing this Project Assessment we:

- Reviewed contract documentation to include the following: Contract, Contract documentation, Contract modifications, and Statement of Work;
- Reviewed the design package (drawings and specifications), quality control reports, quality assurance reports, construction progress photos, final situation report, final receiving document from school headmaster, photos from the United States Army Corps of Engineers inspection on 5 November 2007, invoices, and aerial imagery; and
- Conducted a briefing with the USACE Gulf Region Central on 10 September 2007.

Appendix B. Acronyms

| | |
|-------|---|
| CN | Construction Number |
| ER | Engineering Regulation |
| GRC | Gulf Region Central (Reports to the Gulf Region Division) |
| GRD | Gulf Region Division (Reports to the United States Army Corps of Engineers) |
| m | Meter |
| PCO | Project and Contracting Office |
| QA | Quality Assurance |
| QC | Quality Control |
| SOP | Standard Operating Procedure |
| SOW | Statement of Work |
| USACE | United States Army Corps of Engineers |

Appendix C. Report Distribution

Department of State

Secretary of State

Senior Advisor to the Secretary and Coordinator for Iraq

Director of U.S. Foreign Assistance/Administrator, U.S. Agency for
International Development

Director, Office of Iraq Reconstruction

Assistant Secretary for Resource Management/Chief Financial Officer,
Bureau of Resource Management

U.S. Ambassador to Iraq

Director, Iraq Transition Assistance Office

Mission Director-Iraq, U.S. Agency for International Development

Inspector General, Department of State

Department of Defense

Secretary of Defense

Deputy Secretary of Defense

Under Secretary of Defense (Comptroller)/Chief Financial Officer

Deputy Chief Financial Officer

Deputy Comptroller (Program/Budget)

Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense-Middle East, Office of Policy/International
Security Affairs

Inspector General, Department of Defense

Director, Defense Contract Audit Agency

Director, Defense Finance and Accounting Service

Director, Defense Contract Management Agency

Department of the Army

Assistant Secretary of the Army for Acquisition, Logistics, and Technology

Principal Deputy to the Assistant Secretary of the Army for Acquisition,
Logistics, and Technology

Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Army (Policy and Procurement)

Commanding General, Joint Contracting Command-Iraq/Afghanistan

Assistant Secretary of the Army for Financial Management and Comptroller

Chief of Engineers and Commander, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers

Commanding General, Gulf Region Division

Chief Financial Officer, U.S. Army Corps of Engineers

Auditor General of the Army

U.S. Central Command

Commanding General, Multi-National Force-Iraq

Commanding General, Multi-National Corps-Iraq

Commanding General, Multi-National Security Transition Command-Iraq

Commander, Joint Area Support Group-Central

Other Federal Government Organizations

Director, Office of Management and Budget
Comptroller General of the United States
Inspector General, Department of the Treasury
Inspector General, Department of Commerce
Inspector General, Department of Health and Human Services
Inspector General, U.S. Agency for International Development
President, Overseas Private Investment Corporation
President, U.S. Institute for Peace

Congressional Committees and Subcommittees, Chairman and Ranking Minority Member

U.S. Senate

Senate Committee on Appropriations
 Subcommittee on Defense
 Subcommittee on State, Foreign Operations, and Related Programs
Senate Committee on Armed Services
Senate Committee on Foreign Relations
 Subcommittee on International Development and Foreign Assistance, Economic Affairs, and International Environmental Protection
 Subcommittee on International Operations and Organizations, Democracy and Human Rights
 Subcommittee on Near Eastern and South and Central Asian Affairs
Senate Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs
 Subcommittee on Federal Financial Management, Government Information, Federal Services, and International Security
 Subcommittee on Oversight of Government Management, the Federal Workforce, and the District of Columbia
Permanent Subcommittee on Investigations

U.S. House of Representatives

House Committee on Appropriations
 Subcommittee on Defense
 Subcommittee on State, Foreign Operations, and Related Programs
House Committee on Armed Services
 Subcommittee on Oversight and Investigations
House Committee on Oversight and Government Reform
 Subcommittee on Government Management, Organization, and Procurement
 Subcommittee on National Security and Foreign Affairs
House Committee on Foreign Affairs
 Subcommittee on International Organizations, Human Rights, and Oversight
Subcommittee on the Middle East and South Asia

Appendix D. Project Assessment Team Members

The Office of the Assistant Inspector General for Inspections, Office of the Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction, prepared this report. The principal staff members who contributed to the report were:

Angelina Johnston

Yogin Rawal, P.E.